

Conclusion

The most fascinating aspect of leadership in the 18th century is that musicians were questioning this aspect of performance, were far from indifferent in this regard. This research encourages musicians to take musical leadership more into account when playing orchestral music because it has a great impact on the music itself, but also on the dynamic within the orchestra. In the twentieth century, the conductor grew up to become an artistically more important figure, enjoying more popularity than the composer. Would the exercise of power be more fascinating than the actual creative act of composing or playing? In eighteenth century, all the glory was given to the composer or to the player. Nobody has been praised for his extraordinary skills of beating-time...

Some would argue today (a lot of early music conductors do, in fact) that conducting is the most efficient way to achieve an orchestral performance. An historical-informed musician saying that conducting is the most efficient way to achieve a satisfactory musical result cannot but go against his own convictions, since, according to this argument, historical-informed players shouldn't be using historical instruments since it is much more easier with modern instruments to attain an acceptable musical outcome, these instruments being built to ease the accuracy of intonation, agility, homogeneity and projection. Nowadays, we want to recreate as precisely as possible an orchestral sound universe that in fact never existed. A conductor might help to achieve a performance in which all the musicians play together in an even way, controlling every aspects of the musical discourse, searching for a "vision", an "interpretation". But, was it the case in the eighteenth century? Leadership was more about

articulating a dialogue between musicians, allowing a creative process that opened doors to spontaneousness in every moment, making each performance absolutely unique. Indeed, a leadership practice exerted without or with very little visual signs allowed a more flexible musical discourse by making the orchestral musicians more aware of their role within the ensemble.

To finish in a more practical way, it would be wise to recommend to musical institutions wishing to immerse their students in historically-informed performance to dedicate more energy on experimenting with period leadership practices in order to increase awareness to all musicians. In fact, students should develop their autonomy by playing in orchestral contexts without a conductor, especially if they study historically-informed performance. Indeed, they would naturally gain more flexibility in their orchestral playing skills, listening more to each other and feel more the necessity of taking the reins of the performance, because if there is no conductor involved in a performance, it doesn't mean that nobody is exerting leadership. Of course, keyboard players and violin players should learn the basics of leadership, in Quantz's, Mattheson's and Galeazzi's meanings.

Coming back to our first question that has been asked at the beginning, “Do we really need a conductor?”, one could answer, without any shame : “no, in fact, not really”.

Bibliography

Primary sources

Agricola, Martin. *Musica figuralis Deudsch*. Wittenberg, 1532.

Anonyme. *Il corago, o vero alcune osservazioni per metter bene in scena la composizioni drammatiche*. c. 1630.

Anonyme (Calzabigi?). *Lettre sur le mechanisme de l'opéra italien*. Naples, 1756.

Avison, Charles, *Twenty-six concertos composed for four violins, one alto-violin, a violoncello and ripieno-bass, divided into four books in score for the use of performers on the harpsichord....* Newcastle, 1758

Bach, C.P.E. *Essay on the True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments (1753)*. Eulenburg, London, 1974.

Brenet, Michel. *Les concerts en France*. Librairie Fischbacher. Paris, 1900.

Brossard, Sebastien de. *Dictionnaire de musique*. Ballard. Paris, 1703.

Burney, Charles. *Voyage musical dans l'Europe des Lumières*. Flammarion. Paris, 1992.

Burney, Charles. *The Present State of Music in France and Italy*, London, 1773.

Burney, Charles. *The Present State of Music in Germany the Netherlands and United Nations*. T. Becket, J. Robson and G. Robinson. London, 1775

Burney. *A General History*. London, 1789

Burney, Charles. *An Account of the Musical Performances in Westminster-Abbey, and the Pantheon, May 26th, 27th, 29th, and June the 3d, and 5th, 1784, in commemoration of Händel*. T. Payne and Son. London , 1785

Busby, Thomas. *A Complete Dictionary of Music*, London, 1801

Castil-Blaze, *l'Académie impériale de musique 2 tomes*, Paris, 1855

Corrette, Michel. *Méthode théorique et pratique pour apprendre en peu de tems le Violoncelle*. Paris, 1741

Creuzburg, Eberhard. *Die Gewandhaus-Konzerte zu Leipzig, 1871-1931*. Breitkopf and Härtel. Leipzig, 1931

Dittersdorf, Karl von. *Autobiography*, London, 1896.

Dufresny, Charles. *Amusmens sérieux et comiques*. Amsterdam, 1699

Fétis. *La musique à la portée de tout le monde*. Paris, 1830

Fétis, François- Joseph. *Biographie universelle des musiciens et bibliographie générale de la musique*. Firmin-Didot. Paris, 1866-1868

Fougeroux, Pierre Jacques. *Voyage d'Angleterre d'Hollande et de Flandre fait en l'année 1728 Par Mr Fougeroux Pierre Jacques*. 1728

Framery, Ginguené, de Momigny, MM. *Encyclopédie Méthodique – Musique*. Paris, 1818

Fuhrmann, Martin Heinrich. *Musikalischer Trichter*. Leipzig, 1706.

Galeazzi, *Elementi Teorico Pratici di Musica*, Roma, 1791

Galeazzi, *Elementi Teorico Pratici di Musica (Edizione seconda)*. Ascoli, 1817

English translation : Frascarelli, Angelo. *Elementi Teorico-Pratici di Musica by Francesco Galeazzi, An Annotated English Translation and Study*. Eastman School of Music of the University of Rochester. June 1968.

Goudar, Ange. *Le Brigandage de la musique italienne*. 1777

Gesner, Johann Matthias. *Institutio*. 1738

Grétry, André Ernest Modeste. *Mémoires, ou essai sur la musique*. Paris, 1797

Hanslick, Eduard. *Geschichte des concertwesens in Wien*. 1869

Haydn, Joseph. *Gesammelte Briefe und Aufzeichnungen*; hrsg. D. Martha. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1965.

English translation : Robbins Landon, Howard Chandler. *The collected Correspondence and London Notebooks of Joseph Haydn*. Barrie and Rockliff. London, 1959.

Haydn, Joseph. *Three Quartets for two Violins, Tenor and Violoncello composed by Guiseppe Haydn and Performed under his direction (op.64)*. J. Bland. London, 1792.

Koch, Heinrich Christoph. *Musikalisches Lexicon*. Frankfurt, 1802

Lafranco, Giovanni Maria. *Scintille de musica*. Brescia, 1533

Le Cerf de la Viéville, J.-L. *Comparaison de la musique italienne et de la musique française*. Brussels, 1706

Mattei, Saverio. *Se I Maestri di Cappella*, 1785

Mattheson, Johann. *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*. Hamburg, 1739

Mattheson, Johann. *Der Volkommene Kapellmeister*, translation by Ernest Harris, Johann Mattheson's *Der Volkommene Kapellmeister*. Dissertation, George Peabody College for Teachers, 1969.

Mersenne, Marin. *Harmonie universelle*, Paris, 1636

Mozart, Leopold. *A Treatise on the Fundamental Principles of Violin Playing*, Oxford University Press. Oxford, 1948

Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus. *Briefe und Aufzeichnungen*. Bärenreiter Verlag, 1962

Mozart's Family. *Mozart's letters*. Translated by Lady Wallace. Everyman's Library. London, 2006

Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus. *Correspondance complète*. Traduction de Geneviève Geffray. Flammarion. Paris, 2011

Noinville, Jacques-Bernard Durey de. *Histoire du théâtre de l'opéra en France....* Paris, 1753

Ornithoparchus, Andreas. *Micrologus*. (English translation by John Dowland, original from 1519). London. 1609

Parke, William Thomas. *Musical Memoirs, Comprising and Account of the General State of Music in England from the First Commemoration of Handel in 1784 to the year 1830; 2 vols*. London: H. Coburn & Bentley, 1830

Pisa, Agostino. *Battuta della musica*. 1611

Quantz, *Versuch eiener Anweisung die Flöte Traversiere zu Spielen*. 1752

Quantz, J.J. *On playing the Flute*, Faber and Faber. London, 1966

Quantz, J.J. : *Essai d'une méthode pour apprendre à jouer de la flute traversière*, Edition Robert Martin, Charnay-lès-Mâcon, 2011

Raguenet. *Paralèle des Italiens et des François en ce qui regarde la musique et les opéra*. 1702

Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. *Dictionnaire de musique*. Facsimile de l'édition de 1768. Actes Sud, 2007

Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. *Lettre sur la musique française*. 1753

Sancta Maria, Fray Tomas de. *Libro llamado de taner fantasia*. 1565

Schönfeld. *Jahrbuch der Tonkunst von Wien und Prag*, Vienna, 1796

Simpson, Christopher. *A Practicall Symposium of Musicke*. Brome. London, 1678

Smart, George. *Leaves from the Journals of Sir George Smart*. Longmans, Green and Co., London, 1907

Valentini, Pier Francesco. *Trattato della battuta musicale*. Vatican Library Ms. Barb. Lat. 4417. 1643

Veracini. *Il Trionfo della prattica musicale*, n.d. MS at Florence Conservatory Library; transcribes by Bernhard Paumgartner; translated by Helen Margaret Smith (Ph.D. Diss., Indiana University, 1963

Walther, *Musicalisches Lexicon*, Leipzig, 1732

Secondary sources

Articles

Bassani, Florian. *Polychoral performance practice and "maestro di cappella" conducting*. Performance Practice Review. Vol.17 #1. 2012

Camesi, David. *Eighteenth-Century Conducting Practices*. Journal of Research in Music Education. Vol. 18 no. 4 (Winter, 1970)

Charlton, David. *'A maître d'orchestre...Conducts,': New and Old Evidence on French Practice*. Early Music, Vol. 21, No.3, French Baroque II (Aug., 1993), pp. 340-353

Dean, Winton. *A French Traveller's View of Handel's Operas*. Music and Letters, Vol.55, No.2 (Apr. 1974) pp. 172-178

Forment, Bruno. *An enigmatic souvenir of Venetian opera - Alessandro Piazza's "Teatro" (1702)*. Early Music, Vol.38, No. 3 (August 2010) pp.387-401

Grosbayne, Benjamin. *A Perspective of the Literature on Conducting*. Proceedings of the Musical Association 67th Sess. (1940-1941), pp.74-101

Leppert, Richard. *Musical Confrontation and Cultural Difference in Early 18th Century London*. Early Music, Vol. 14, No.3 (Aug., 1986)

Marx, Hans Joachim. *The instrumentation of Handel's early Italian works*. Early Music. Vol. 16, No.4 (Nov., 1988) pp. 496-505

Spitzer, John. *The Birth of the Orchestra in Rome — An Iconography Study*. Early Music Vol.19 #1, (Feb.,1991)

Stowell, Robin. *'Good Execution and Other Necessary Skills': The Role of the Concertmaster in the Late 18th Century*. Early Music, Vol. 16, No. 1 (Feb., 1988), pp. 21-33

Warriner, Charles L., *Leadership in the Small Group*. American Journal of Sociology, Vol. 60, No.4 (Jan., 1955), pp. 361-369

Zaslaw, Neal. *When is an Orchestra Not an Orchestra?*. Early Music (Vol.16 #4, Nov., 1988) pp.483-495

Zaslaw, Neal. *Toward the Revival of the Classical Orchestra*. Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association, Vol. 103 (1976 - 1977), pp. 158-187

Books

- Basler Jahrbuch für Historische Musikpraxis 2000 - Direktion und Dirigieren, Amadeus. Basel, 2001
- Baumann, Dorothea. *Music and Space 'a systematic and historical investigation into the impact of architectural acoustics on performance practice followed by a study of Handel's Messiah*. Peter Lang, 2011
- Bowles, Edmund A. *Musical Ensemble in Festival Books, 1500-1800*. UMI Research Press. London, 1989
- Butt, John. *Music education and the art of performance in the German Baroque*. Cambridge University Press. 1994
- Bowen, José Antonio. *The Cambridge Companion to Conducting*. Cambridge University Press, 2003
- Carse, Adam. *Orchestral conducting*. Augener, 1935
- Carse, Adam. *Orchestra in the 18th century*. Heffer & Sons, 1940
- Carse, Adam. *The orchestra from Beethoven to Berlioz : a history of the orchestra in the first half of the 19th century, and of the development of orchestral baton-conducting*. Hefner. 1948
- Carse, Adam, *Orchestral Conducting-A Textbook for Students and Amateurs*, Read Books, 2008
- Cavallini, Ivano, *Il direttore d'orchestra: genesi e storia di un'arte*. Marsilio Editori, 1998
- Clark, Caryl. *The Cambridge Companion to Haydn*. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge, 2005
- Galkin, Elliott W. *A History of Orchestral Conducting, in Theory and Practice*. Pendragon Press
- Grosbayne, Benjamin. *A Bibliography of works and articles on conductors, conducting and related fields, in various langages, from the sixteenth century to the present time*. Brooklyn College, 1933
- Houle, George, *Meter in music, 1600-1800: Performance, perception, and notation*. Indiana University Press,. 1987
- Kahl, Willi. *Selbstbiographien Deutscher Musiker des 18. Jahrhunderts*. Verlag. Staufen, 1948
- Koury, Daniel J. *Orchestral Performance Practices in the 19th century; Size, proportions and seating*. University of Rochester Press. USA, 1981

Landon, Howard Chandler Robbins. *The collected Correspondence and London Notebooks of Joseph Haydn*. Barrie and Rockliff. London, 1959

Leux-Henschen, Irmgard. *Joseph Martin Kraus in seinen Briefen*. Edition Reimers. Stockholm, 1978

McVeigh, Simon. *Concert Life in London from Mozart to Haydn*. Cambridge University Press. 1993

Nettl, Paul. *Forgotten Musicians*. Philosophical Library. 1951

Pierre, Constant. *Histoire du concert Spirituel 1725-1790*. Société Française de Musicologie. Paris, 1974

Salmen, Walter (General Editor). *The Social Status of the Professional Musician from the Middle Ages to the 19th Century*. Pendragon Press. New York, 1989

Schuller, Gunther. *The Compleat Conductor*. Oxford University Press, New York, 1997

Schünemann, Georg. *Kleine Handbücher der Musikgeschichte nach Gattungen - Geschichte des Dirigierens*. Druck und Verlag von Breitkopf & Härtel. Leipzig. 1913

Sénart, Jean-François. *Le geste musicien*. Louise Courteau. Montreal, 1988

Spitzer, John and Zaslaw, Neal, *The birth of the orchestra. History of an institution, 1650-1815*, Oxford University Press. Oxford, 2004

Strunk, Oliver. *Sources Readings in Music History*. Norton & Company. 1950 (New Edition 1998)

Thesis

Carlisle, Benjamin W. *Who is the Leader of this Band? Orchestral Leadership in the Late 18th Century as Witnessed in the Writings of Dr. Charles Burney*. University of Nebraska. May 2008

Groman, Mary Alyce. *The Mannheim Orchestra under the Leadership of Christian Cannabich*. University of North Carolina. 1979

Thompson, Shirley. *The Autograph Manuscripts of Marc-Antoine Charpentier : Clues to Performance*. University of Hull. September 1997

Iconographies

Fig.1. W. A. Mozart (Tom Hulce) conducting his music in Forman's movie *Amadeus*, 1984

Fig.2. Example of cheironomy as practice in ancient Egypt. Accessed through : http://www.ancientlyre.com/the_original_3000_year_old_music_of_the_bible_revealed/

Fig.3. Cover page of Ornithoparchus, Andreas. *Micrologus*. (English translation by John Dowland, original from 1519). London, 1609

Fig.4. Bowles, Edmund A. *Musical Ensemble in Festival Books, 1500-1800*. UMI Research Press. London, 1989 - Figure 192 (The Imperial Banquet Table at the Ritter Stuben)

Fig. 5. Fux's opera *Costanza e Fortezza* in 1723, Prague.

Fig.6. A performance of Rameau's *La Princesse de Navarre*, Versailles, 1745; sketch by C. N. Cochin *frs*. Paris, Musée de l'Opéra.

Fig.7. Diagram of Orchestra seating-plan for Handel commemoration at Westminster Abbey, London, May-June 1784. Found in *An Account of the Musical Performances in Westminster-Abbey, and the Pantheon, May 26th, 27th, 29th; and June the 3^d, and 5th, 1784, in Commemoration of Handel*. London, T. Payne and Son, 1785.

Fig. 8. Ghezzi, Pier Leone. Nicola Logroscino leading his own opera, 1753.

Fig. 9. Count Basie's band, with singer Jimmy Rushing, 1943. Accessed through : <http://bjazz.unblog.fr/2012/10/08/kansas-city-the-big-band-era-count-basie/>

Fig. 10. Peter Haas, "Friderich der Grosse in seinen Erholungs Stunden", c. 1786. Stiftung Stadtmuseum Berlin.

Fig. 11. Jena collegium musicum, Jena collegium musicum, c.1740. Watercolor on parchment. Museum für Kunst und Gewerbe, Hamburg - Birth of the orchestra

Fig. 12. Royal theater of Turin orchestra seating-plan.
Galeazzi, *Elementi Teorico Pratici di Musica (Edizione seconda)*. Ascoli, 1817

Fig. 13. Desden opera house orchestra seating plan
Galeazzi, *Elementi Teorico Pratici di Musica (Edizione seconda)*. Ascoli, 1817

Fig.14. Zoffany, Johann. *The Cowper and Gore Families*. 1775

Fig. 15. Bowles, Edmund A. *Musical Ensemble in Festival Books, 1500-1800*. UMI Research Press. London, 1989 - Figure 235 (Performance of Giuseppe de Maio's Serenade. *Il Sogno d'olympia*, in the Royal Opera House, 6 November 1747

Fig. 16. Ricci, Marco. *Rehearsal of an Opera*, c1709. New Haven, Yale Center for British Art, Paul Mellon Coll.)

Appendix



Fig. 17. Smith, C Lorrain. *A Sunday Concert at the home of Charles Burney*, 1782



Fig. 18. Chodowiecki, Daniel Nikolaus. *Chamber music in Germany*. Kunstammlungen Veste Coburg.



Fig. 19. Performance of an opera, possibly at the Eszterhaza opera house. unknown artist.



Fig. 20. Attributed to Giovanni Michele Graneri, Interno del Teatro Regio di Torino, 1740. Museo Civico d'Arte Antica, Turin.